SCHOOL AND DISTRICT LEADERS’ ROLE IN DIVERSIFYING THE TEACHER WORKFORCE

RAMON B. GOINGS
LARRY J. WALKER
HEATHER COTINGOLA-PICKENS
Loyola University Maryland

ABSTRACT
Diversifying the teaching profession has garnered attention from researchers, policy makers, and educational stakeholders. However, missing within this conversation is the role of school and district leaders in diversifying the teaching profession. We argue that without considering school and district leaders, diversity initiatives will not have a long-term systemic impact. Thus, this article fills in a gap in the literature on this topic. First, we provide a brief overview of the current racial and ethnic demographics of the teaching workforce and student population and discuss the barriers to recruiting and retaining a diverse teacher workforce. Second, we highlight the factors that have been found to influence the recruitment and retention of racial diversity of teachers at the pre-service and in-service levels. Lastly, we provide recommendations for school-based and district leaders on how they should plan for diversifying their teacher workforce.

INTRODUCTION
Over the three decades, researchers, policy makers and practitioners have discussed the importance of increasing the racial and ethnic diversity in the U.S. teaching profession (Goings & Bianco, 2016; U.S. Department of Education, 2016). Unfortunately, the teaching workforce has remained predominantly White. As a result, stakeholders have called for the increased representation of teachers of color. Currently, they only comprise 17% of the teaching workforce while students of color represent over 50% of the public student population (U.S. Department of Education, 2016).

As school districts seek to diversify their teacher workforce, there are two important questions to consider: Why is there a need to diversify the teaching workforce? What are the benefits of a multi ethnic/racial teaching workforce? Fortunately, researchers have explored these questions and have provided empirical evidence that highlights the benefits and need to diversify the teaching workforce. For instance, Gershenson, Hart, Lindsay and Papageorge (2017) found in their analysis from two states of student-teacher same-race matching that, for Black students who had a same-race teacher, they performed better on standardized tests and their teachers had more positive perceptions of them as students than Black students who did not have a same-race teacher. Additionally, Easton-Brooks, Lewis and Zhang (2009) found similar findings for a nationally representative sample of kindergarten African American students. In their study, they found that students who had an African American teacher had higher reading scores than those students who did not. Researchers have also found that while White teachers do have the ability to teach students of color, it is important for students of color to have access to teachers who share similar ethnic/racial experiences (Bristol, 2015; Goings & Bianco, 2016; Walker, 2016).

Though students of color have been found to benefit from having access to a diversified teaching workforce, having access to teachers of color is also important for White students (Bryan...
As Villegas and Irvine (2010) suggested in their analysis of diversifying the teacher workforce, “seeing people of color in professional roles communicates to White students that adults of racial/ethnic minority background are successful and contributing members of society” (p. 177). Moreover, a recent study by Cherng and Halpin (2016) investigated student perceptions of their minority and White teachers. They suggested that White students have more positive perceptions of their Black and Latino teachers than their White teachers. More specifically, the researchers found that students believed their Black teachers more than their White teachers held them to “high academic standards and support their efforts . . ., to help them organize content . . ., and to explain clearly ideas and concepts and provide useful feedback” (p. 411). Given the impact that teachers of color can have on all students, there has to be more of a concerted effort to change these workforce trends.

Nationally, researchers have focused extensively on understanding the lack of representation of teachers of color in the pipeline. For instance, scholars have investigated recruiting and retaining teachers of color (Achinstein, Ogawa, Sexton, & Freitas, 2010; Bryan & Ford, 2014; Goings & Bianco, 2016), experiences of students of color in teacher preparation programs (Amos, 2016; Goings, Bristol, & Walker, in press; Sleeter, 2001), in-service experiences of teachers of color (Bristol, 2018; Gist, 2014; Lynn, 2006), retention of teachers of color (Ingersol, May, & Collins, 2017), and attrition of teachers of color (Ingersol, Merrill, & May, 2014). While research in this area has increased, it is primarily focused on how to recruit more teachers into the profession and understanding why teachers stay or leave. While this is important, a glaring omission from this scholarly discourse is the role the school-based and district level leaders have in diversifying the teaching workforce. Moreover, there has been limited discussion about how school and district-level leaders plan to support the unique needs of teachers from a variety of ethnic and racial backgrounds. Thus, this article seeks to add to this conversation by exploring the role that school leaders (both district and school level) have in supporting efforts to diversify the workforce.

In this article we first provide a brief overview of the current racial and ethnic demographics of the teaching workforce and student population. We then turn to providing the factors that have been found to influence the recruitment and retention of racial diversity of teachers at the pre-service and in-service levels. Lastly, we provide recommendations for school-based and district leaders on how they should approach diversifying their teacher workforce.

**EXPLORING RACIAL DIVERSITY DEMOGRAPHICS OVER TIME**

Over the last few years, policymakers, pundits, and educators have focused on studying the shifting racial and ethnic demographics in the United States. In particular, Colby and Ortan’s (2014) U.S. census analysis suggests that people of color will become the majority of US citizens by 2040. The findings mirror the recent population shift in public schools nationwide, which are experiencing a drastic turn in their ethnic and racial composition. More specifically, US public schools are projected by 2022 to experience an increase in Black, Hispanic, Asian/Pacific Islander, and multi-racial students while simultaneously having a decrease of White student enrollment (Hussar & Bailey, 2013).

As the racial and ethnic demographics in US public schools have shifted, the teacher workforce has lagged behind because of uneven recruitment and retention efforts. According to the US Department of Education (2016) between the 1987-88 and 2011-12 school years there has been a five percent decrease in White teachers. However, the only racial/ethnic group to see an increase in their representation was Hispanic teachers. Table 1 provides a more detailed account of the differences in racial demographics of the teaching workforce over this time.
Table 1. Teacher Diversity from 1987-1988 to 2011-2012 School Year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1987-1988 School Year</th>
<th>2011-2012 School Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian/Alaskan Native</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>&lt;1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FACTORS IMPACTING CURRENT TEACHING WORKFORCE TRENDS

When looking at the ongoing conversation to diversify the teacher workforce, researchers and policy makers often point to the various factors that impact students of color who enter the teaching profession. While a more in-depth discussion has taken place in greater detail elsewhere (Villegas & Irvine, 2010), it is important to explore how the recruitment and retention of teachers of color and the experiences of current teachers of color impacts the current teaching shortage.

Pre-Service and In-Service Recruitment Efforts

There are several issues that contribute to the lack of teacher diversity in PreK-12 settings. This includes flawed recruitment efforts to strengthen the teacher preparation pipeline. The U.S. Department of Education (2016) found that students of color were disproportionately represented in teacher education programs compared to their representation in their overall population on college campuses. As a result, there is a small population of students of color who are majoring in education. Recently, research which explored the experiences of students of color in high school illuminates why efforts have failed. For instance, Goings and Bianco (2016) in their investigation of the factors that influence and deter 22 Black male high school students from entering the teaching profession found that Black boys did not consider teaching due to the negative experiences they had with their teachers as students. Thus, for some students of color, encountering negative experiences as a student can serve as a deterrent to considering the teaching profession. In teacher preparation programs racially and ethnically diverse teacher candidates encounter a similar hostile college environment as students in Goings and Bianco’s (2016) study where they are not viewed as academicians (McGee, 2014). Moreover, teacher recruitment campaigns are halted due to barriers such as the Praxis I, which is a standardized examination focused on students’ reading, mathematical and writing skills (Nettles, Scatton, Steinberg, & Tyler, 2011; Petchauer, 2012).

Fortunately, there are colleges who successfully recruit diverse teacher candidates. Minority serving institutions (MSIs) which include historically Black colleges and universities (HBCUs), Hispanic serving institutions (HSIs), Tribal Colleges and Universities (TCUs), and Asian American and Native American Pacific Islander Serving Institutions (AANAPISIs) have an important role in producing diverse teachers (Gasman, Samoya, & Ginsberg, 2017, 2016; Goings et al., in press).
Gasman et al. (2017) found in their analysis of the role of MSIs in recruiting racially diverse teachers that over 33% of Black, Asian American, and American Indian/Alaskan Native educators receive their education degrees from MSIs. Moreover, “HSIs alone account for 44% of all education degrees conferred to Hispanics” (Gasman et al., 2017, p. 89). Despite the impact MSIs have on educating ethnically and racially diverse teachers, there is limited research that explores the experiences of students in these institutions and how they impact their desire to enter the teaching profession.

**Teacher Retention**

Understanding efforts to recruit aspiring teachers into the profession is an important step to address the shortage. In addition, it is equally critical to examine the experiences of in-service teachers of color. Achinstein, Ogawa, and Sexton (2010) concluded in their review of 70 articles related to the retention of teachers of color that they have a higher attrition rate than White teachers. Additionally, the researchers suggested that because teachers of color are placed in hard to staff urban schools with limited access to supportive administrators and limited professional development opportunities they are more likely to leave.

While quantitative studies explain why teachers of color are likely to leave the profession (Ingersoll, 2001; Ingersoll, Merrill, & May, 2014), qualitative studies provide a more nuanced account to explain why they leave the profession. Bristol (2018) for instance examined the experiences of Black male teachers in Boston Public Schools and found that educators who were the only Black male teacher on staff reported a greater desire to leave in contrast to Black men who had at least one other Black male colleague. Moreover, Kohli (2016) found in her analysis of 218 narratives from teachers of color that schools served as racially hostile environments influenced retention rates. These researchers highlighted the importance of immersing teachers of color into environments where their perspectives and identity are valued.

In response to research that suggests teachers of color experience racism and stereotyping from colleagues and students and limited access to race/gender specific professional development, school districts have been intentional in developing targeted professional development to support teachers of color (Bristol, 2018). For instance, Montgomery County Public Schools (Maryland) developed the Building Our Network of Diversity (BOND) program which provides support for the recruitment, retention, and development of male educators of color that work in the school system (Hicks, 2018). Moreover, Boston Public Schools has developed a similar initiative with their Male Educators of Color Executive Coaching Program, which addresses the needs of Black, Hispanic, Asian, and Indigenous teachers. Important to the sustainability of these programs is the support from school system leadership. Thus, as we begin to think about diversifying the teacher workforce, it is critical to consider the role of school and district-based leaders in creating a diverse teacher workforce.

**ROLE OF SCHOOL-BASED AND DISTRICT LEADERS IN DIVERSIFYING THE TEACHER WORKFORCE**

During conversations about diversifying the teaching profession, scholars, practitioners, and policy makers often focus on the educational barriers that impede the progress of teachers of color. While those issues provide insight into the lack of racial diversity in the teaching workforce, often the role of school and district-based leaders are left out of the conversation. However, these leaders have an important role in addressing these workforce shortages.

At the school level, principals can have a direct influence on the racial diversity of their
staff. For instance, in an effort to decentralize school districts, principals increasingly have the autonomy to hire teachers that they deem are a fit for their school (Laura, 2018). School leaders that recognize that teacher diversity is important are more likely to recruit and retain teachers of color. They understand that students of all racial, ethnic, linguistic backgrounds need teachers with similar lived experiences. While hiring teachers of color is not a panacea it does send a message to the school-based staff and students that they value diversity. Moreover, hiring teachers of color signifies to the local community that the leadership team believes in creating an inclusive environment. Parents may be more likely to attend school events including parent-teacher conferences, performances, and off-site trips if the staff reflects the local community. Researchers including Boykin and Noguera (2011) highlighted the role that positive student-teacher and parent-teacher relationships have on student performance. Thus, hiring teachers from diverse backgrounds could positively impact student outcomes.

At the district level superintendents have the ability to make diversifying the school district’s teaching workforce a priority. Local education leaders are uniquely suited to develop data driven initiatives that mirror the BOND program in Maryland. District leaders that choose to ignore the need for teachers from multi-ethnic, racial backgrounds risk alienating internal and external stakeholders. Transformational leaders understand that diversity is a strength and can alleviate cultural misunderstandings that can create tensions between teachers and community leaders. In addition, new and veteran teachers will recognize that the district leaders are committed to addressing the teacher of color gap. This is particularly important for districts that have experienced high attrition rates and low teacher and student morale.

In addition to superintendents, human resource officers (HROs) have an important role in diversifying the teaching workforce, but often are left out of the conversation. In many school districts HROs are gatekeepers responsible for recruitment and initial interviewing of teacher candidates. D’Amico, Pawlewicz, Earley and McGeehan (2017) found in their analysis of one large school district that, Black candidates were less likely than White candidates to be hired. In addition, they found that when Black candidates were hired they were significantly more likely to be placed in schools with high concentrations of students living in poverty and in schools described as struggling. These findings allude to the role that HROs can play as they can ensure that diverse candidates are given opportunities to work in a variety of schools and not just the hard to staff schools. Given the lower numbers of teachers of color entering the profession, HROs have to be strategic to ensure they not only support the recruitment of teachers of color, but to then place them in buildings where they can flourish and be likely to stay in their role as teachers.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR SCHOOL AND DISTRICT-BASED LEADERS ON PLANNING FOR A DIVERSE TEACHER WORKFORCE

The lack of diversity in school districts throughout the country has reached a tipping point. Moreover, given the national attention to this issue by political pundits and philanthropic organizations, there is an opportunity to gain ground on supporting school leaders in diversifying their teacher workforce. Ten recommendations are provided for school leaders to try engaging in teacher diversity efforts.

Develop Grow Your Own Programs

As previous research suggests, recruiting students of color into the teaching workforce while they are enrolled in college is a flawed strategy. As a result, many school districts have either created internal programs or what are referred to as grow your own programs to meet their needs.
While initially these programs were operating in silos, in 2017, several of these programs collaborated and developed the Grow Your Own (GYO) Collective. The GYO Collective seeks to develop a national model to recruit and retain a diverse teacher workforce (GYO, 2017). Many of these programs developed alternative pathways for high school students among others to encourage them to teach.

One poignant example is the Pathways2Teaching (P2T) program. The P2T program provides a concurrent enrollment elective course titled “Introduction to Socially Just Education.” The course is offered during the school day and is designed to encourage and support high school students of color to explore teaching as a career through a social justice and equity lens. Teaching is presented as a path to disrupt inequities within their communities (Goings, Bianco, & Brandehoff, 2018; Tandon, Bianco, & Zion, 2015). Currently in its 8th year, Pathways2Teaching was launched during the 2010-2011 academic school year and began as a pilot program consisting of one course offered at a local urban high school through a partnership between the University of Colorado Denver and a local school district. The program also provides students who participate in high school the opportunity to earn a paraeducator certification, which allows them to serve as paraeducators in schools while they complete their college degree in education.

**Building Intentional Relationships with MSIs to Recruit Teachers**

Considering the impact that MSIs have on diversifying the teacher workforce these institutions must be central to the efforts to recruit and retain a diverse teacher candidate pool (Gasman et al., 2017). Moreover, for school leaders there is an opportunity to foster sustainable relationships with MSIs. For instance, school systems can host MSI college fairs where students gain exposure to institutions with important support systems. As more students consider attending an MSI, school systems can develop partnerships that allow students who attend these institutions to earn a job in their respective school system upon graduating from college. Increasing the number of teachers of color in schools will require new initiatives that seek to meet the needs of students from various backgrounds.

Historically MSIs have played a critical role recruiting and nurturing students focused on closing the opportunity to learn gap. Frequently these students are civically engaged and focused on solving complex societal issues including poverty (Walker, 2015). Consequently, school districts that utilize social justice frameworks to empower students (PreK-12) may have a recruiting advantage over conservative districts. Similar to other periods in U.S. history, college students are intentionally choosing professions that allow them to positively influence community ecosystems. In contrast to other post-secondary institutions, MSIs have a long history of student activism. For this reason, school districts should carefully consider adopting more progressive teaching strategies and frameworks to strengthen the MSI teacher pipeline.

**Development of Support Programs for Women Teachers of Color**

As school systems have sought to diversify the teaching workforce, stakeholders have focused on the low percentage of men of color (Bristol & Goings, 2018). As a result, diversity programs support the needs of men while ignoring other subgroups. However, we argue that there is a need to support women of color. Currently, they serve an important role in public education and have unique experiences because of the role gender and race play in the United States. Ignoring their racial and gendered experiences could unintentionally increase attrition rates. Historically women have navigated workspaces that unfairly devalue their contributions. It is imperative that teachers of color have access to programs that recognize their contributions while creating places to discuss
challenges. Programs that seek to support their needs should be data driven. In addition, teachers should have the opportunity to select from an array of professional development courses that provide feedback on important issues.

Collecting Career Experience Data from Current and Former Teachers

It is important for school-based and district leaders to consider examining the experience of their current and former employees. This information can be critical in determining the factors that keep teachers in the workforce as well as understanding the reasons that some teachers choose to leave that particular school district and, in some cases, the profession entirely. From this data collection, school district leaders can then develop more targeted professional development and support structures for teachers of color. These types of initiatives not only signal for current teachers that leadership wants to support their professional growth, but it also signals to pre-service and early career educators that the particular districts seeks not only to recruit them into a job but sustain and nurture their career.

Create Positive School Conditions for Current Teachers of Color

While it is important for school and district leaders to recruit more teachers of color to their schools, first we believe in the importance of retaining the current teachers of color working in schools. Given the literature (Kohli, 2016) that suggest teachers of color are placed in hostile working environments, school principals have an opportunity to ensure teachers of color are supported and are able to work in a supportive environment. This can be accomplished by ensuring that teachers of color are not solely placed in classrooms with the most behavioral or academic challenges. Students need to see teachers of color in various classroom settings which include gifted/advanced placement classrooms. Moreover, school principals can create schooling conditions that are conducive to their success. For instance, school principals can ensure that classroom equipment such as projectors and computers along with school infrastructure equipment like air conditioners are working. While this may seem simple, research has pointed to the importance of having safe working conditions (Carver-Thomas, 2018).

Revising the Training for School Leaders Responsible for Hiring Teachers

As we push for schools to increase their teacher diversity, leaders who will be responsible for recruiting, hiring, and retaining teachers of color may also need training to ensure their hiring practices are equitable and that they create an environment that is conducive to the success of teachers of color. While this can be done at the school district level, there is an opportunity for national organizations to get more involved in this training. For instance, the American Association of School Personnel Administrators (AASPA) which serves as school district HR directors nationwide and its local state chapters could lead the efforts to train school principals on teacher diversity hiring strategies.

Implementing Strategic Hiring Timelines and Compensation Packages

Because of the lack of teachers of color in the pipeline, many school districts are competing for candidates. One strategy that could provide school districts leverage is the use of creating an earlier timeline for teacher hiring. Carver-Thomas (2018) suggested that school districts vet teacher candidates before they graduate from college in order to fast-track their hiring. This becomes important because if school districts wait until June and July to hire teachers of color they may have already taken positions at other districts who have an earlier hiring timeline. In addition to having an earlier hiring timeline school district leaders can implement new compensation programs for teacher candidates. Although many school districts are continually fighting fiscal reductions, they could
initially start with improving the compensation of teachers of color in hard to staff disciplines. The combination of strategic hiring timelines and compensation policies can provide school districts an opportunity to increase the representation of teachers of color.

**Strengthening Interstate Recruitment Efforts**

Although public schools (nationally) serve majority-minority populations some school districts struggle to hire teachers of color because of a limited local pool of minority candidates. As a result, they must utilize various methods to successfully recruit and retain teachers from diverse backgrounds (Sutcher, Darling-Hammond, & Carver-Thomas, 2016). This can be difficult for districts that do not offer teachers of color access to communities with individuals from similar lived backgrounds. However, recruiters can offer various incentives to out of state pre-service or in-service teachers willing to relocate. Districts should consider hiring additional staff to visit states with significant minority populations. Increasing interstate efforts could strengthen linkages with post-secondary institutions and local leaders.

**Empower Teachers to Identify New Teachers**

Frequently the best recruiters are current teachers. School and district leaders should consider incentivizing opportunities for current teachers of color to identify new or experienced practitioners. For example, offering bonuses would encourage educators to seek out individuals from similar ethnic and racial backgrounds to choose a new school or district. Creating leadership opportunities for educators can improve the school culture (Curtis, 2013). In addition, teachers would feel invested and provide new recruits with a support system during difficult times.

**Develop Innovative Initiatives**

The success of GYO and other programs highlight the importance of developing unconventional recruitment initiatives. School and district leaders should consider thinking outside of the box to create new programs that could become a template for public school leaders throughout the United States. Far too often, efforts to identify and hire teachers of color fail because leaders follow outdated programs from other states. Working collaboratively with stakeholders including parents, current teachers, administrators among other community members could lead to creating programs that meet current and future needs. For instance, school leaders could recruit community members to initially serve as paraprofessionals to gain experience while also partnering with local teacher preparation programs so those individuals can earn their teaching credential and become teachers of record.

**CONCLUSION**

Increasing the racial/ethnic diversity in the teacher workforce is an imperative since teachers of color promote success for all students. Currently, a need exists to increase the recruitment as well as retention efforts. Intentional recruitment of teachers of color involves promoting positive experiences of students of color as well as presenting teaching as a meaningful profession at the secondary level. Additionally, building upon the success of MSI’s recruitment of teachers is essential to diversify the profession. Furthermore, school-based leaders such as principals, superintendents and HROs all have important roles in recruitment as well as retention of teachers of color. These leaders directly impact who is hired as well as having the authority to create environments that are supportive rather than hostile to teachers of color. Current programs and initiatives provide promising examples of how educational leaders can utilize their influence to recruit and retain teachers of color and create supportive and successful educational environments for teachers and students alike.
Educational leaders can build on these examples to create meaningful change in their school system to foster success for all students.

REFERENCES


Boykin, A. W., & Noguera, P. (2011). *Creating the opportunity to learn: Moving from research to practice to close the achievement gap.* Alexandria, VA: ASCD


Goings, R. B., Bristol, T. J., & Walker, L. J. (in press). Exploring the transition experiences of one Black male refugee pre-service teacher at a HBCU. *Journal for Multicultural Education.* Advanced online publication.


